The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

An International Journal of Current Research and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

ISSN 0140-525X

Editor

Stevan Harnad

Editorial Assistant

Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors

Animal Intelligence
David Premack
Department of Psychology, University of Pennsylvania

Behavioral Biology
Hans Kummer
Zoologisches Institut und Museum der Universität Zürich

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence
Zenon Pylyshyn
Department of Psychology, University of Western Ontario

Ethology and Neuroethology
John C. Fentress
Department of Psychology, Dalhousie University, Halifax, N.S.

Higher CNS Function
Robert W. Doty
Center for Brain Research, University of Rochester

History and Systems
Julian Jaynes
Department of Psychology, Princeton University

Language and Cognition
Peter Wason
Psycholinguistics Research Unit, University College London

Neurobiology
Barry H. Smith
Surgical Neurology Branch
National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, Md.

Neuropsychology
Karl Pribram
Department of Psychology, Stanford University

Volume 1 1978

Cambridge University Press
Cambridge London New York
1978

Published by the Syndics of The Cambridge University Press
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP
Bentley House, 200 Euston Road, London NW1 2DB
32 East 57th Street, New York, NY 10022

© Cambridge University Press 1978

Printed in the United States of America by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania

Contents Volume 1 1978

Number 1, March 1978

Target Article

Kupfermann, I. & Weiss, K. The command neuron concept 3

Open Peer Commentary

Hoyle, G. *Where did the notion of "command neurons" come from?* 10
Andreae, J. H. *Descriptive and prescriptive names* 11
Balaban, P. *"General" or "general assembly"? On command neuron systems* 12
Bennett, M. V. L. *Command neurons: know and say what you mean* 13
Bullock, T. H. *"Command" is heuristic until we know better* 15
Burke, R. E. *"Command" as functional concept rather than cellular label* 15
Chapple, W. D. *Do we need "comand" neurons?* 16
Davis, W. J. *On the trail of the command neuron* 17
Evoy, W. H. *Functional descriptions of neurons that influence behavior* 19
Fentress, J. C. *On the sufficiency of command neurons* 20
Fowler, C. A. & Turvey, M. T. *The concept of "command neurons" in explanations of behavior* 20
Fraser, P. *Vector coding and command fibres* 22
Grillner, S. *Command neurons or central program controlling system?* 23
Hermann, A. *Command fibers: only strategic points in neuronal communication systems* 24
Horridge, G. A. *Nouns, neurons, and parallel pathways* 25
Iles, J. F. *The command neurone concept in mammalian neurophysiology* 25
Kater, S. B. & Granzow, B. *Is "command" at the top of the hierarchy?* 26
Krasne, F. *The crayfish giant fibers as decision and command neurons* 28
Kristan, Jr., W. B. & Weeks, J. *Difficulties in applying a functional definition of command neurons* 28
Larimer, J. L. *Command neuron, ar. evolving concept* 29
Lewis, E. R. *Causally oriented devices* 30
Lleinas, R. & Bunge, M. *Restricted applicability of the concept of command in neuroscience: dangers of metaphor* 30
Lynch, J. C. *The command function concept in studies of the primate nervous system* 31
McCarthy, J. *Command neurons and unitary behavior* 32
Rosenbaum, D. A. *Command neurons and effects of movement contexts* 32
Stein, P. S. G. *Defense of the Wiersma-Kennedy concept of the command neuron* 33
Tsukada, Y. *Ambiguity of the proposed definition* 34
Wiersma, C. A. G. *The original definition of command neuron* 34
Wine, J. J. *Triggering and organizing functions of command neurons in crayfish escape behavior* 35
Zucker, R. S. *Command neurons: a more precise definition reveals gaps in our evidence and limits to our models* 35
Hoyle, G. *Who believes in "command neurons"?* 36

Authors' Response

Kupfermann, I. & Weiss, K. Quis imperat? a panorama of perspectives 37

Target Article

Bindra, D. How adaptive behavior is produced: a perceptual-motivational alternative to response reinforcement 41

Open Peer Commentary

Bitterman, M. E. *Bindra's S-S contiguity theory of instrumental learning* 52
Black, A. H. *Is Bindra's theory of adaptive behavior radical enough?* 53
Bolles, R. C. *The more things change . . .* 53
Booth, D. A. *A long stride towards sense in psychology* 54
Catania, A. C. *What constitutes explanation in psychology* 55
Dennett, D. C. *Requisition for a pexgo* 56
Epstein, R. *Reinforcement, explanation, and B. F. Skinner* 57
Fentress, J. C. *Defining behavioral representations* 58
Flynn, J. P. *Sensory vs. motor effects of brain stimulation* 58
Gallistel, C. R. *The irrelevance of past pleasure* 59
Gilbert, R. M. *Misconceptions about the origins of behavior* 60
Hilgard, E. R. *With reinforcement in trouble, what about motivation?—Bindra's alternative* 61
Hulse, S. H. *The problem of serial order in adaptive behavior: why not some formal cognitive structure* 62
Irwin, F. W. *Some comparisons of Bindra's theory with a situation-act-outcome system* 63
Jenkins, H. M. *Signal learning and response learning* 64
Kendler, H. H. *Decision rules, decision rules* 64
Killeen, P. R. *Pexgo: a plausible construct in need of data* 65

Klingsporn, M. J. *On explanation, familiarity, and response sequencing* 66
Logan, F. A. *Intelligent vs. stupid behavior, or learning concepts vs. responses* 67
Mackintosh, N. J. *Limits on reinterpreting instrumental conditioning in terms of classical conditioning* 67
Mazur, J. E. *Reinforcement is dead: long live reinforcement theories* 68
Menzel, Jr., E. W. *Reinforcement theory: an experimenter-oriented rather than a subject-oriented philosophy* 68
Mowrer, O. H. *Learning theory, a will-o-the-wisp?* 69
Murray, E. J. *Implications for clinical behavior modification* 70
Navarick, D. J. *A framework with no foundation: comments on Bindra's perceptual-motivation theory of response production* 71
Notterman, J. M. *Feedback systems invite tautological constructs* 71
Pribram, K. H. *Stimulus theory and response theory: their complementarity and neurobehavioral basis* 72
Rosenblatt, J. S. *Behavioral evolution and individual development* 73
Ryan, T. A. *Bindra's theory from the perspective of human motivation: unit size, stimulus centering, and the value of neural theory* 74
Salzinger, K. *A death too soon reported* 75
Soltysik, S. S. *Omnipotent pexgos and the goddess parsimony* 76
Staats, A. W. *Bindra's perceptual-motivational theory and social behaviorism's emotional-motivational theory: separatism exemplified* 77
Stein, D. G. *Perception as response* 77
Teevan, R. C. *Skinner, Maslow, and common sense* 79
von Glasersfeld, E. *Another minor revision, or the disregard for control theory and the analysis of inductive feedback systems* 79
Warren, J. M. *Neural mechanisms and Occam's razor* 80
Wasserman, E. A. *Bindra's theory: some successes and precursors* 80
Wong, R. *Behavioral flexibility in learning situations: adaptive or adaptable behavior?* 81
Wood, W. S. *In defense of descriptive behaviorism, or theories of learning still aren't necessary* 82

Author's Response

Bindra, D. A behavioristic, cognitive-motivational, neuropsychological approach to explaining behavior 83

Target Article

Pylyshyn, Z. Computational models and empirical constraints 93

Open Peer Commentary

Andreae, J. H. *AI: another defense of the field* 100
Arbib, M. A. *The halting problem for computational cognitive psychology* 100
Atherton, M. *The artificiality of computer models* 100
Cohen, L. J. *Rational reconstruction of inferential processes—a task straddling the AI-CS boundaries* 101
Cushing, S. & Hornstein, N. *Software systems, language, and empirical constraints* 102
Dennett, D. C. *Why not the whole iguana?* 103
Domotor, Z. *AI: model-theoretic aspects* 104
Dreyfus, H. L. *Empirical evidence for a pessimistic prognosis for cognitive science* 105
Goodluck, H. *Levels of evolution and psycholinguistic evidence* 105
Harmon, L. D. *Introspection, black boxes, and machine equivalence* 106
Haugeland, J. *The problem of generality* 107
Hayes, P. J. *Doing AI but saying CS* 108
Johnson-Laird, P. N. *The correspondence and coherence theories of cognitive truth* 108
Leibovic, K. N. *The problem of validation* 109
Lenat, D. B. *On astrophysics and superhuman performance* 109
Longuet-Higgins, C. *On describing cognitive processes* 110
McDermott, J. *On A.I. as psychology: now and then* 110
Newell, A. *State-of-the-art constraints* 111
Ortony, A. *Cognitive psychology, artificial intelligence, and cognitive simulation* 112
Pascual-Leone, J. *Computational models for metasubjective processes* 112
Pribram, K. H. *On behalf of the neurosciences* 113
Rodger, R. S. *Computer-specific methods* 113
Schank, R. C. *AI vs. CS: a methodological distinction* 114
Simon, T. W. *The AI/CS distinction and theory evaluation* 114
Sloman, A. *Artificial intelligence and empirical psychology* 115
Sutherland, N. S. *Task constraints and process models* 116
Treisman, M. *On the relation between AI and CS: the heart of the problem* 117
Ullman, S. *A.I. systems and human cognition: the missing link* 117
Weimer, W. B. *A.I. and the methodology of scientific research: some cautions and limitations* 119
Wilks, Y. *Artificial intelligence and real constraints* 120

Author's Response

Pylyshyn, Z. The A.I. debate: generality, goals, and methodological parochialism 121

Target Article

Roland, P. E. Sensory feedback to the cerebral cortex during voluntary movement in man 129

Open Peer Commentary

Chapple, W. D. *Consciousness and the limitations of psychophysical approaches* 148
Dickinson, J. *The function of sensory feedback* 148
Duysens, J. & Loeb, G. *Precortical processing of somatosensory information* 149
Dyhre-Poulsen, P. *Possible sources of discriminitive kinaesthetic information* 150
Freund, H.-J. *The role of extrapyramidal structures* 150
Goodwin, G. M. *The neural mechanisms subserving kinesthesia* 151
Granit, R. *Breaking down open doors* 152
Grigg, P. *On the attribution of a functional role to joint afferent neurons* 152
Iannone, A. M. *What constitutes "proof" in the study of neural control of movement?* 153
Kelso, J. A. S. *Changing views of feedforward and feedback in voluntary movement* 153
Levitt, M. *On the role of mental set in voluntary movement* 154
Libet, B. *What is conscious sensory experience, operationally?* 156
McCloskey, D. I. *Sense of effort and sense of muscular tension* 156
Millar, J. *Lab strategy vs. life strategy* 157
Mpitsos, G. J. *Musculotendinous receptors in conscious human behavior: experimental factors* 157
Pribram, K. H. *Movements and acts: distinguishing their neurophysiology* 158
Pubols, L. M. *On intellectual compensation and deafferentation* 159
Roberts, T. D. M. *The transmission of parameters by neural messages* 159
Shebilske, W. L. *Sensory feedback during eye movements reconsidered* 160
Somjen, G. G. *What muscle spindles and Golgi tendon organs could and could not signal to the brain* 161
Sontag, K.-H. *Conscious and unconscious motor decisions* 162
Stein, J. *The interaction of motor and sensory signals in proprioception* 162
Stevens, J. K. *The corollary discharge: is it a sense of position or a sense of space?* 163
Trevarthen, C. *Cortical collaboration and consciousness* 165
Walsh, E. G. *Sensing springiness* 166
Wells, M. J. *Invertebrate stretch receptors and consciousness* 166
Wiesendanger, M. *Toward contextual instead of either/or thinking* 167

Author's Response

Roland, P. E. The cerebral cortex and conscious kinaesthetic and tensional information 167

Number 2, June 1978

Target Article

Brainerd, C. J. The stage question in cognitive-developmental theory 173

Open Peer Commentary

Baldwin, J. D. & J. I. *Stages resulting from continuous underlying variables* 182
Berndt, T. J. *Stages as descriptions, explanations, and testable constraints* 183
Ennis, R. H. *Description, explanation, and circularity* 184
Epstein, H. T. *Some additional data relevant to considerations about the existence of cognitive-developmental stages* 185
Fischer, K. W. *Structural explanation of developmental change* 186
Flavell, J. H. *Developmental stage: explanans or explanandum?* 187
Gibson, K. R. *Cortical maturation: an antecedent of Piaget's behavioral stages* 188
Karmiloff-Smith, A. *On stage: the importance of being a nonconserver* 188
Kendler, T. S. *On falsifying descriptions* 190
Kinsbourne, M. *Maturational succession vs. cumulative learning* 191
Klahr, D. *Rages over stages* 191
Kurtines, W. M. *Measurability, description, and explanation: the explanatory adequacy of stage models* 192
Lipsitt, L. P. *"Stages" in developmental psychology* 194
Markman, E. M. *Problems of logic and evidence* 194
Neimark, E. D. *Improper questions cannot be properly answered* 195
Nelson, K. *Structural and developmental explanations: stages in theoretical development* 196
Olson, D. R. *A structuralist view of explanation: a critique of Brainerd* 197
Parker, S. T. *Species-specific acquisition vs. universal sequence of acquisition* 199
Pascual-Leone, J. *Piaget's two main stage criteria: a selective reply to Brainerd* 200
Rosenthal, T. L. *Agnostic gauges and Genevan stages* 201

Scandura, J. M. *"Measurement sequences," Piagetian structures, and high-order rules* 201
Siegler, R. S. *Is Piaget a Pied Piper?* 202
Smedslund, J. *Measurement sequences, logical necessity, and common sense* 203
Uzgiris, I. C. *Holistic aspects of the stage notion* 204
Wetherick, N. E. *In defense of circularity* 205
White, S. H. *Which comes first—describing or explaining?* 205
Yonas, A. & Carleton, L. R. *Conjoint construct validation* 206

Author's Response

Brainerd, C. J. Invariant sequences, explanation, and other stage criteria: reflections and replies 207

Target Article

Haugeland, J. The nature and plausibility of Cognitivism 215

Open Peer Commentary

Andreae, J. H. *On inference from input/output* 226
Arbib, M. A. *On making distinctions that are not maintained* 227
Atherton, M. *The scope of cognitivism* 228
Baron, R. J. *On explanation, holograms, moods, and skills* 229
Charniak, E. *How to register dissatisfaction with A.I.* 230
Cummins, R. *Systems and cognitive capacities* 231
Dennett, D. C. *Co-opting holograms* 232
Domotor, Z. *Cognitive problems and problems of cognitivism* 233
Dreyfus, H. L. *Cognitivism vs. hermeneutics* 233
Economos, J. *Mind that last step; I think it's loose* 234
Greeno, J. G. *Systems and explanations* 235
Harré, R. *Half-way to realism: some sympathetic comments on Haugeland's defence of cognitivism* 236
Hayes, P. J. *Cognitivism as a paradigm* 238
Matthews, R. J. *Two remarks on the characterization of IBBs* 239
Maxwell, G. *Cognitivism, psychology, and physics* 240
McCarthy, J. *Competence cognitivism vs. performance cognitivism* 241
Monk, R. *Cognitivism and cognitive psychology* 242
Natsoulas, T. *Haugeland's first hurdle* 243
Otto, H. R. *A program is not an explanation* 243
Pinker, S. *Mind and brain revisited: forestalling the doom of cognitivism* 244
Pribram, K. H. *Image, information, and fast Fourier transforms* 245
Puccetti, R. *Are right hemisphere activities cognitivistic?* 245
Rey, G. *Worries about Haugeland's worries* 246
Rorty, R. *A middle ground between neurons and holograms* 248
Schwartz, R. *Some limits and problems of cognitivism* 248
Simon, T. W. *On Cognitivism's explanations and limitations* 249
Taylor, C. *Indivisible performances, implicit grasp, and the problem of meaningfulness* 250
Tweney, R. D. *Is making reasonable sense reasonable?* 251
von Glasersfeld, E. *Some problems of intentionality* 252
Wilson, C. *Cognitivism's contributions: some questions* 253
Yevick, M. L. *The two modes of identifying objects: descriptive and holistic for concrete objects; recursive and ostensive for abstract objects* 253

Author's Response

Haugeland, J. The critical assessment of Cognitivism: a closer look 254

Target Articles

Corballis, M. C. & Morgan, M. J. On the biological basis of human laterality: I. Evidence for a maturational left-right gradient 261

Morgan, M. J. & Corballis, M. C. On the biological basis of human laterality: II. The mechanisms of inheritance 270

Open Peer Commentary

Abler, W. L. *Asymmetry and evolution* 277
Annett, M. *Throwing loaded and unloaded dice* 278
Bakan, P. *Why left-handedness?* 279
Beaumont, J. G. *On testing the maturational left-right gradient hypothesis* 280
Berlucchi, G. *Does bigger equal better, functionally?* 281
Bertelson, P. *Interpreting developmental studies of human hemispheric specialization* 281
Boklage, C. E. *On cellular mechanisms for heritably transmitting structural information* 282
Bradshaw, J. L. *Handedness and human cerebral asymmetry: some unanswered questions* 286
Bryden, M. P. *Handedness, heritability, and perceptual laterality studies* 287
Bureš, J. *A fictitious gradient* 288
Černáček, J. & Podivinský, F. *Environmental influence on lateralization* 289

Chaurasia, B. D. *Motor asymmetries of the human body other than handedness* 289
Collins, R. L. *In the beginning was the asymmetry gradient, even when it was null: a propositional framework for a general theory of the inheritance of asymmetry* 289
Davidson, R. J. *Lateral specialization in the human brain: speculations concerning its origins and development* 291
Davis, T. A. *Reversible and irreversible lateralities in some animals* 291
Dimond, S. J. *Lateralization and unitarianism* 293
Ettlinger, G. *Have we forgotten the infant?* 294
Fuller, J. L. *If genes are not right-handed, what is?* 295
Geffen, G. *Human laterality: cerebral dominance and handedness* 295
Geschwind, N. *Pathological right-handedness* 296
Goodglass, H. *Objections to a growth gradient theory of cerebral dominance* 296
Goodwin, B. C. *Symmetry-breaking processes and morphogenesis* 297
Guerrier, P. *Evidence for absence of preformed genetic or plasmatic laterality during early embryonic development* 297
Hardyck, C. & Leiman, A. L. *On the probable genetic basis of human handedness* 298
Hicks, R. E. *On the homogeneity of human handedness* 299
Hudson, P. T. W. & Marshall, J. C. *Is a unified (cross-species) theory of asymmetries feasible?* 300
Jantz, R. L. *Dermatoglyphics, development and human laterality* 300
Kasinov, V. B. *Is there a single basis for biological laterality?* 301
Kinsbourne, M. *Pitfalls in the box score approach to evolutionary modelling* 302
Kopp, N. *Possible contribution of neuroanatomy to the comprehension of growth and inheritance of human cerebral asymmetries* 302
Layton, Jr., W. M. *The determination of morphological asymmetry* 303
LeMay, M. *Prominence of the right side of the brain* 304
Lepori, N. G. *Asymmetric blastomere movement during gastrulation* 304
Meshcheryakov, V. N. *Are genes left-right agnosic?* 305
Mittwoch, U. *Changes in the direction of the lateral growth gradient in human development—left to right and right to left* 306
Molfese, D. L. & Schmidt, A. L. *Human laterality: is it unidimensional?* 307
Ness, A. R. *Enter the sea-unicorn* 308
Neville, A. C. *On the general problem of asymmetry* 308
Nottebohm, F. *Precocial skills for the precocial hemisphere? Several untested hypotheses* 309
Oppenheimer, J. M. *Gradients and genes* 310
Perzigian, A. J. *The nature and nurture of human laterality* 310
Porac, C. & Coren, S. *Relationships among lateral preference behaviors in human beings* 311
Preilowski, B. *Problems with "grand schemes" and handedness* 312
Reeve, E. C. R. *Asymmetry in the narwhal, alpheus, and drosophila* 313
Rife, D. C. *Heredity and handedness* 313
Siegel, M. I. *Microenvironmental effects and fluctuating asymmetry* 314
Singh, I. & Chhibber, S. R. *Anatomical asymmetries in the limbs of man and other vertebrates* 315
Skibinski, D. O. F. *Is variation in cytoplasmic codes heritable?* 315
Springer, S. P. *Handedness and cerebral organization in twins—implications for the biological basis of human laterality* 316
Steklis, H. D. *Of gonads and ganglia* 317
Taylor, D. C. *The biases of sex and maturation in lateralisation: "isomeric" and compensatory left-handedness* 318
Van Valen, L. *The control of handedness* 320
Vermeij, G. J. *Left asymmetry in the animal kingdom* 320
von Heyden, H. W. *Cellular laterality* 322
Warren, J. M. *The Left Force: homology or analogy* 322
Wehrmaker, A. *Left-handedness: etiological clues from situs inversus* 322
Whitaker, H. A. *Is the right leftover?* 323
Wolpert, L. *The problem of directed left-right asymmetry in development* 324

Authors' Response

Morgan, M. J. Genetic models of asymmetry should be asymmetrical 325
Corballis, M. C. Brain twisters and hand wringers 331

Number 3, September 1978

Target Article

Puccetti, R. & Dykes, R. W. Sensory cortex and the mind-brain problem 337

Open Peer Commentary

Scheibel, A. B. *On textural variance and the neocortical mission: a lightning rod for the obvious* 344
Anderson, Jr., R. M. *Relativistic color coding as a model for quality differences* 345

Armstrong, D. M. *On passing the buck* 346
Beloff, J. *The inevitability of dualism* 347
Block, N. *Straw materialism* 347
Booth, D. A. *Mind-brain puzzle versus mind-physical world identity* 348
Bridgeman, B. *The similarity of the sensory cortices: problem or solution?* 349
Bunge, M. *Cytoarchitectonic similarity does not entail functional identity* 350
Churchland, P. M. & P. S. *The virtuosity of the sensory cortex and the perils of common sense* 350
Dennett, D. C. *What's the difference: some riddles* 351
Dismukes, K. *What mind-brain problem?* 351
Economos, J. *What is it like, Mr. Puccetti?* 352
Freemon, F. R. *Visualizing visual cortex in the mind's eye* 353
Gedye, J. L. *On accounting for one kind of difference in terms of another kind of difference* 353
Gibson, K. R. *Asking the right questions: other approaches to the mind-brain problem* 354
Globus, G. G. *What is the sound of one hand clapping, the touch of a still wind, the sight of a "black hole"?* 355
Green, M. B. *Some difference is enough difference* 356
Harman, G. *What is experience made of?* 356
Hebb, D. O. *A problem of localization* 357
Mackie, J. L. *Inexplicit dualism* 357
Mandler, G. *Mind (psychology) is not (currently) reducible to body (neurobiology)* 358
Marks, L. E. *Does the brain mind?* 358
Maxwell, G. *Mind and brain: an arduous task by neuroscience, physics, and philosophy* 359
Milner, P. M. *What's the matter with mind?* 360
Natsoulas, T. *What do we know when we know what having auditory experience is like?* 361
Norman, D. A. *So what should information look like?* 361
Perry, J. R. *Defenses for the mind-brain identity theory: causal differences* 362
Ritter, W. *How completely are the processes that constitute the brain known?* 363
Rose, S. P. R. *Mind-brain; Puccetti & Dykes' non-solution to a non-problem* 363
Rosenthal, D. M. *The insignificance of incommensurate variations* 364
Shallice, T. *Are the properties of cells relevant for understanding consciousness?* 364
Smart, J. J. C. *Cortical localization and the mind-brain identity theory* 365
Sperry, R. *Mentalist monism: consciousness as a causal emergent of brain processes* 365
Szentágothai, J. *A false alternative* 367
Uttal, W. R. *Codes, sensations, and the mind-body problem* 368
Ward, M. F. *The mind-brain issue unsimplified* 368
Wilks, Y. *Leibniz, location, and distinguishing types of sensation* 369

Authors' Response

Puccetti, R. & Dykes, R. W. Localizationism and dualism: a second look at the paradox 369

Target Article

Rosenthal, R. & Rubin, D. B. Interpersonal expectancy effects: the first 345 studies 377

Open Peer Commentary

Adair, J. G. *The combined probabilities of 345 studies: only half the story?* 386
Babad, E. Y. *On the biases of psychologists* 387
Barber, T. X. *Expecting expectancy effects: biased data analyses and failure to exclude alternative interpretations in experimenter expectancy research* 388
Carlier, M. & Gottesdiener, H. *On the misuse of statistics* 390
Chubin, D. E. *Inattention to expectancy: resistance to a knowledge claim* 390
Collins, H. M. *Replication of experiments: a sociological comment* 391
Elashoff, J. D. *Box scores are for baseball* 392
Ellsworth, P. C. *When does an experimenter bias?* 392
Fiske, D. W. *The several kinds of generalization* 393
Gadlin, H. *Great expectations . . . big disappointment* 394
Glass, G. V. *In defense of generalization* 394
Hilgard, E. R. *Expectancy effects: valuable or frightening?* 395
Johnson, R. F. Q. *Experimenter expectancy effects: alternative explanations* 396
Johnson, R. W. *Interpersonal expectancy effects exist: what do we know beyond that?* 396
Jung, J. *Self-negating functions of self-fulfilling prophecies* 397
Krippner, S. *The importance of Rosenthal's research for parapsychology* 398
Kruglanski, A. W. *Quantifying the interpersonal expectancy effect: on the place of statistical significance in a program of research* 399
Mayo, R. J. *Statistical considerations in analyzing the results of a collection of experiments* 400
Miller, A. G. *And in this corner, from Cambridge, Massachusetts . . .* 401
Nosanchuk, T. A. *Experimenter expectancy and the effects of academic debates* 402
Page, S. *Toward evaluating the "reality" of interpersonal expectancy effects* 403
Rao, K. R. *Expectancy effects, ESP effects, and replicability* 403
Silverman, I. *Expectancy effects revisited* 404
Singer, J. E. *Once you've seen a decade of studies, you've seen them all* 405

Smale, G. G. *Artifact or agent of change: the self-fulfilling prophecy redefined* 405
Stewart, C. G. *Progress toward the statistical and psychological significance of expectancy effects* 406
Valsiner, J. *Expectancy effects: a paradoxical area of research* 408
Wilkins, W. E. *Expectancy research: the question of quality* 408
Wilkins, W. W. *A poor case for causes* 409

Authors' Response

Rosenthal, R. & Rubin, D. B. Issues in summarizing the first 345 studies of interpersonal expectancy effects 410

Target Article

Rajecki, D. W., Lamb, M. E., & Obmascher, P. Toward a general theory of infantile attachment: a comparative review of aspects of the social bond 417

Open Peer Commentary

Ainsworth, M. D. S. *The Bowlby-Ainsworth attachment theory* 436
Bischof, N. *On the necessity of "appropriate behavior" on the part of the caregiver* 438
Blanchard, D. C. *Is there adaptive significance in the persistence of infantile attachment to maltreating attachment figures?* 439
Brown, R. T. *Three scientists in search of a theorist (apologies to Pirandello)* 440
Cairns, R. B. *Beyond attachment?* 441
Chalmers, N. R. *Ethological theory and infantile attachment* 441
Dienske, H. *The parental bond and the game of theorizing* 442
Dolhinow, P. *Langur monkey mother loss and adoption* 443
Eble, B. A. *Attachment: the two sides of one coin* 444
Eiserer, L. A. *Maltreatment effects and learning processes in infantile attachment* 445
Gibson, K. R. *Sociobiology, brain maturation, and infantile filial attachment* 446
Gottlieb, G. *The epigenetic character of development* 446
Gunnar, M. R. *How can we test attachment theories if our subjects aren't attached?* 447
Hess, E. H. *The road to general attachment theory: little headway* 448
Hoffman, H. S. *On the matter of interpretation and judgement in the evaluation of theory* 448
Immelmann, K. *Imprinting and infantile attachment* 449
Kaufman, I. C. *Evolution, interaction, and object relationship* 450
Kovach, J. K. *Infantile attachment: a general theory or a set of loosely-knit paradigms?* 451
Masters, J. C. *Implicit assumptions regarding the singularity of attachment: a note on the validity and heuristic value of a mega-construct* 452
Mineka, S. & Rush, D. *Attachment theories maltreated?* 453
Passman, R. H. & Adams, R. E. *Learning theory and infantile attachment: a re-evaluation* 454
Rutter, M. *Attachment: its meaning and consequences* 455
Salzen, E. A. *Orientation and affect in infantile attachment* 456
Scott, J. P. *The systems theoretic approach to social behavior* 457
Sluckin, W. *Infantile attachment and exposure learning* 458
Solomon, R. L. *Further implications of opponent-process theory* 459
Suomi, S. J. *Is a general theory of attachment feasible?* 459
Wolff, P. H. *Detaching from attachment* 460

Authors' Response

Rajecki, D. W. & Lamb, M. E. Interpretations, reinterpretations, and alleged misinterpretations of theory and data concerning attachment 461

Target Article

Steriade, M. Cortical long-axoned cells and putative interneurons during the sleep-waking cycle 465

Open Peer Commentary

Ben-Ari, Y. & Naquet, R. *Acetylcholine: synaptic transmitter of the arousal system?* 485
Berlucchi, G. *Sleep and waking and two populations of neurons* 486
Borbély, A. A. *Active wakefulness and paradoxical sleep: common mechanisms?* 487
Corazza, R. *Electrophysiological differentiation between output cells and interneurons: an alternate methodological proposal* 487
Dewan, E. M. *Physiological measurements and the "programming" hypothesis for the function of REM sleep* 488
Fishbein, W. *Cortical interneuron activation, D sleep and memory* 489
Freemon, F. R. *A time for inhibitory neurons to rest* 489
Glenn, L. L. & Guilleminault, C. *Neuronal identification and classification strategies* 490
Greenberg, R. *The cortex finds its place in REM sleep* 490
Henriksen, S. J. *The cellular substrates of state* 491
Humphrey, D. R. *On the proportions of identified output cells and putative interneurons in the precentral arm area of the monkey's motor cortex* 492
Iwama, K. & Fukuda, Y. *Sleep-waking studies on the lateral geniculate nucleus and visual cortex* 494

Jones, B. E. *Toward an understanding of the basic mechanisms of the sleep-waking cycle* 495
Jouvet, M. *Cortical interneurons and paradoxical sleep* 495
Krnjević, K. *Cholinergic control of excitability in the sleep-waking cycle* 496
McCarley, R. W. & Hobson, J. A. *Output neurons, interneurons, and the mechanisms and function of sleep* 498
Metz, J. & Meltzer, H. Y. *Why do cortical long-axoned cells and putative interneurons behave differently during the sleep-waking cycle?* 499
Morrison, A. R. *The problem of determining selectivity of neuronal firing during different behavioral states* 499
Oniani, T. N. *Cortical unit activity and the functional significance of the sleep-wakefulness cycle* 500
Oshima, T. *Intracellular activities of cortical laminae I–III neurones during EEG arousal* 500
Pasik, T. & P. *On the possibility of a third category of neurons in cortical circuitry* 501
Pearlman, C. A. *Neurophysiologic implications of information processing during D sleep* 501
Pribram, K. H. *Possible functions of sleep—memory consolidation?* 502
Ramon-Moliner, E. *Two basic neuronal configurations in the cerebral cortex* 502
Ranck, Jr., J. B. *The importance of neuronal interaction patterns* 503
Routtenberg, A. *The role of interneurons (Golgi type II) in memory* 503
Satoh, T. *Possible reticular mechanism underlying altered activity of cortical neurons during sleep* 504
Schlag, J. *On the significance of observations about cortical activity during the sleep-waking cycle* 505
Segundo, J. P. *Postsynaptic potential influences upon postsynaptic impulse generation* 505
Szentágothai, J. *Interneurons and memory consolidation* 506
Tömböl, T. *Classification of cortical interneurons on the basis of Golgi impregnation* 506
Valleala, P. *A comment on wakefulness as a reference state in sleep studies* 507
Vanderwolf, C. H. *What does cortical electrical activity have to do with sleep?* 507
Wagman, A. M. I. *Memory-consolidation hypothesis of REM sleep* 508
Webb, A. C. *How important is the mean frequency of neuronal discharge?* 509
Woody, C. D. *Identification and functional characterization of electrophysiologically studied cortical neurons* 510

Author's Response

Steriade, M. Cell classification and changes in neuronal activity with shifts in vigilance state 511

Number 4, December 1978

A Special Issue on Cognition and Consciousness in Nonhuman Species

Target Articles

Premack, D. & Woodruff, G. Does the chimpanzee have a theory of mind? 515
Griffin, D. R. Prospects for a cognitive ethology 527
Savage-Rumbaugh, E. S., Rumbaugh, D. R., & Boysen, S. Linguistically-mediated tool use and exchange by chimpanzees *(Pan Troglodytes)* 539

Open Peer Commentary

Griffin, D. *Experimental cognitive ethology* 555
Rumbaugh, E. S., Rumbaugh, D. R., & Boysen, S. *Sarah's problems of comprehension* 555
Beck, B. B. *Talkers and doers* 557
Bennett, J. *Some remarks about concepts* 557
Bernstein, I. S. *Awareness, intention, expectancy and plausibility* 560
Burge, T. *Concept of mind in primates?* 560
Burghardt, G. M. *Closing the circle: the ethology of mind?* 562
Candland, D. K. *How the animals lost their minds* 563
Churchland, P. S. & P. M. *Internal states and cognitive theories* 565
Davis, L. H. *Intentions, awareness, and awareness thereof* 566
Davis, R. T. *Animal cognition without human consciousness* 567
Dawkins, M. *The second time around* 568
Dennett, D. C. *Beliefs about beliefs* 568
Dingwall, W. O. *Animals and the rest of us: Descartes versus Darwin* 570
Farrell, B. A. *Some considerations in the philosophy of mind* 571
Gardner, H. *A social synthesis* 572
Gould, J. L. *Behavioral programming in honey bees* 572
Greenfield, P. M. *Developmental processes in the language learning of child and chimp* 573
Grene, M. *Basic concepts for cognitive ethology* 574
Groves, C. P. *What does it mean to be conscious?* 575
Harman, G. *Studying the chimpanzee's theory of mind* 576
Hebb, D. O. *Behavioral evidence of thought and consciousness* 577
Heffner, J. *Perception and animal consciousness: the philosophical context* 577
Jaynes, J. *In a manner of speaking* 578

Jolly, A. *The chimpanzees' tea-party* 579
Lewis, M. *Social knowledge and mental acts* 580
Limber, J. *Good-bye behaviorism!* 581
Lockard, J. S. *Speculations on the adaptive significance of cognition and consciousness in nonhuman species* 583
MacKay, D. M. *Evaluation as an indicator of intention* 584
Mellgren, R. L. & Fouts, R., S. *Mentalism and methodology* 585
Menzel, Jr., E. W. & Johnson, M. K. *Should mentalistic concepts be defended or assumed?* 586
Moravcsik, J. M. *Can the concept of cognition bear the weight psychologists place on it?* 587
Morton, A. *What to look for in comparing species* 588
Norman, D. A. *Stop already, my mind is made up* 589
Pribram, K. H. *Consciousness, classified and de-classified* 590
Pylyshyn, Z. W. *When is attribution of beliefs justified?* 592
Rachlin, H. *Who cares if the chimpanzee has a theory of mind?* 593
Riesen, A. H. *Responses versus cognitions* 594
Sarles, H. *One new theme and . . .* 595
Savage, C. W. *Isn't the answer obvious?* 596
Schubert, G. *Cooperation, cognition, and communication* 597
Scott, J. P. *Fantasy and communication* 600
Segal, E. F. *Does mind matter?* 601
Sloman, A. *What about their internal languages?* 602
Snowdon, C. T. & Hodun, A. *What's the matter with mind?* 603
Stich, S. P. *Cognition and content in non-human species* 604
Ullman, S. *Mental representations and mental experiences* 605
Weiner, B. & Landes, S. *A cognitive psychology for infrahumans* 606
Zaidel, E. *Of apes and hemispheres* 607

Authors' Responses

Griffin, D. R. Helpful "talk" on what to "do" 609
Savage-Rumbaugh et al. Describing chimpanzee communication: a communication problem 614
Premack, D. & Woodruff, G. Chimpanzee theory of mind: causality, purpose, and the use of symbols 616